

as much science as is necessary. This may be what prompted Sir George Martin to comment that Levitin ‘explains it all beautifully’. The exploration of uniquely musical processes such as perspective, re-arrangement and representation, as well as the integration of music and dance and music and words, are equally fascinating. One area that seemed to be missing for me was reference to neurodiversity, given both our growing understanding of how the brains of many people process various things in different ways and the growth particularly in America and Australia of a lobby that takes the view that such individuals, be they autistic, dyslexic or suffer mood disorders, ‘have arguably been sidelined by the disability debate’ (Jacobs, 2010).

Nonetheless, this is worthy reading for all of us involved in music in education. The thinking that Levitin provokes will equip us for those recurring situations in which we are called upon to articulate and justify music’s place in the curriculum. For trainee teachers of music the book is worthy of attention. For many trainees the values and significance of music are often personal, assumed and implicit. *The World in Six Songs* is a great contribution to making these values a little less subjective and considerably more explicit. Levitin also reminds us all that ‘good melody (let alone rhythm) knows no boundaries of class, education or upbringing’ (p. 11). If we take this to refer broadly to all aspects of and all genres of music, there lies a philosophy that should be at the heart of every school music department.

References

- JACOBS, B. (2010) *Times Higher Education* 29 July – 4 August 2010, No. 1,958.
 LEVITIN, D. (2006) *This is Your Brain on Music*. London: Atlantic Books.
 MITHEN, S. (2005) *The Singing Neanderthals*. London: Orion.
 SACKS, O. (2008) *Musophilia*. London: Picador.

- STORR, A. (1992) *Music and the Mind*. London: Harper Collins.

JON TIBKE
 UNIVERSITY OF CUMBRIA

doi:10.1017/S0265051711000131

Living in Worlds of Music: A View of Education

and Values by Minette Mans. New York: Springer, 2009. 242 pp., hardback, £89.99. ISBN: 9789048127061

Minette Mans brings together a wide range of social science perspectives in this study that explores the broad concept of ‘musical worlds’, and its relevance to the practice of music education. A comprehensive, theoretical consideration of the subject is well supported by reference to relevant research in anthropology, ethnomusicology and music education. The discussion is further broadened by the inclusion, at key points, of narratives and perspectives drawn from musicians and scholars around the globe; along with the author’s own experience of, and acquaintance with a variety of African and ‘Euro-American’ musical cultures, this offers a refreshingly comparative approach that sets out to avoid cultural bias and geocentrism. While Mans herself admits to the ambitious nature of the project and, related to this, ‘an over-abundance of questions’ (p. 5), two threads of inquiry are consistently maintained throughout. First, how can we theorize, understand, and interpret the musical worlds that come to be constructed by groups and individuals? Second, how can such theorizations, understandings and interpretations inform evaluations of current practices and ideas in institutional music education? These questions arise from a deeper concern with trends in modern differentiated societies whereby, according to Mans, much music-making appears to

lack a clear sense of 'specific purpose' (p. 57), and that, by the same token, formal music education often takes place without recourse to the socio-cultural environments and aesthetic values that give rise to particular musical systems and repertoires in the first place (pp. 163–169).

The first chapter, entitled 'Theoretical Background', outlines Mans's research methodology and goes on to consider what might constitute a musical world. We get a fairly definite sense of this by page 14:

A musical world encompasses all our sonic knowledge, choices, aesthetic preferences, and memories. It refers broadly to customs of musical practice based on a system of knowledge, understanding, and behaviors brought about by individual and collective musical experiences within a given cultural context(s).

Although Mans mostly employs a Weberian 'ideal type' of musical world throughout the text, that is to say, a relatively closed musical world in the socio-cultural sense, she also allows for the possibility of fluidity between and among groups and individuals, and thus for the possibility of inhabiting parallel musical worlds. This opening discussion might have benefited from a consideration of Becker's (1982) seminal work in the interpretation of 'art worlds', based on an ethnographic study of jazz musicians and their audiences, or from some engagement with Mantle Hood's (1960) concept of bimusicality as employed in subsequent ethnomusicology and music education studies (although bimusicality is briefly alluded to on page 39 in the narrative by Japanese musician Koji Matsonobu). The introductory chapter closes with a brief outline of the (mostly constructivist) education theory principles that are adapted throughout the text.

The second chapter, 'Thinking Music: Processes of Musical Cognition' offers an original perspective in the investigation of musical worlds (or musical cultures/musical traditions) insofar as it draws on cognitive studies and music psychology in an attempt to infer how collective musical knowledge, behaviours, selections, systems and identities are generated and maintained, and at the same time are subject to change. Although Mans acknowledges her assumption here that most of what these psychological studies have found with regard to individuals 'can be applied more broadly to groups of people' (p. 7), a more teased-out rationale for this social psychology approach to her musical worlds framework would have been desirable, especially if we consider that psychology's original focus on the individual subject is a culture-specific ideation. That said, the ensuing theoretical treatment of ideas such as categorization, recognition and memory is skilfully applied to a wide variety of socio-musical contexts.

The third chapter is pivotal insofar as Mans adapts (and expands) earlier conceptions and configurations of specific 'musical worlds' by ethnomusicologists Simha Arom (p. 49), and Emmanuelle Olivier and Manuel Valentin (p. 50) to present her own theoretical model outlining three broad layers of 'a specific cultural group's musical organization'; broadly speaking, the macro- (a society, its systems and values), the meso- (musical repertoires and genres) and the micro- (sonic materials and musical behaviours). This is represented in a very detailed, but not very clear figure on page 52. The discussion that follows is somewhat speculative, and is particularly lacking in examples pertaining to modern, urban contexts. Arguably though, the model's potential value lies in Mans's constructivist and dialectical analysis of how the levels might interact. For example, on

page 70 she writes:

The micro-organization of music takes place within the sonic structures as well as the music-making processes. The music-making process is informed by cultural context and individual taste, both of which give rise to the musical constructions and patterning of sounds.

The model is also well employed later on in the book when Mans argues that much school music education fails to go beyond the micro-level, and consequently is not meaningful for many learners or relevant to society as a whole.

Chapter 4, 'Inhabiting a Musical World' opens with a sophisticated discussion on identity (and the related concepts of 'recognition' and 'belonging'), and this is enriched by research findings from the anthropology of music along with a short but insightful contribution from music therapist Evan Ruud. Mans then goes on to consider what she terms 'normative and aesthetic values invoked by musical worlds' (p. 107). Once again the anthropology literature informs her analysis, and referring back to the model outlined in Chapter 3 she draws a distinction between musical values linked to the macro-level (relating to wider cultural and societal concerns) and those values that are specific to musical materials and behaviours. Somewhat unnerving though is Mans's list of 'values we might find in music' (pp. 114–115), insofar as some of the different 'ideal type' values she speculates on appear to represent a set of assumed normative conceptions along dualistic lines: for example, 'materialism'/'non-materialism', 'individualism'/'collectivism', and 'continuity'/'present'. In the same vein, it is surprising to find that Mans does not tease out some of the arguments vis-à-vis the appropriateness or otherwise of the concept of the aesthetic, particularly in a book that places emphasis on cross-cultural

comparisons. Related to this, it is clear that Mans has difficulty in accommodating popular music to her musical worlds model: 'without specific purpose, music tends to revert to entertainment, as is the case with much contemporary musical culture' (57). Part of the problem here, I believe, emerges from the overall structuralist orientation of Mans's socio-musical theory. Although the text does contemplate individuals and groups who experience changing cultural landscapes – and in that context, presumably, evolving 'social purposes' for music – it seems disinclined to embrace the formation of musical communities that in various ways criss-cross geographical boundaries and social structures (on this, see Middleton, 1990, pp. 127–168; Slobin, 1993; Bennett, 2000).

The fifth chapter directly addresses problems in contemporary music education, critically, the chasm of values, identities and meanings that in many cases separate 'organic' musical worlds from formal music education (p. 166). Mans presents a thought-provoking comparison of these two 'sides', drawing on her model of musical organization as well as on constructivist perspectives on musical learning. Not surprisingly perhaps, community music is proposed as a potential bridge, though concrete examples of how this might work are not included. Mans also reports on initiatives that seek to reconnect 'real' musical principles and learning styles with the classroom, such as those developed by Lucy Green (2008) following that writer's earlier research with popular musicians. Other, existing successful integrations of formal education with musical worlds might merit further consideration here – the tradition of cathedral choir schools, to give one example. The remaining sections of Chapter 5 deal respectively with the themes of musical development, multicultural music education, creativity, assessment and teacher

education. The discussion in each of these is lively and stimulating, with Mans's musical worlds concept offering a fresh perspective on issues that have long been contemplated by music educators.

Perhaps the most important message to emerge from this book is a need to rethink the purpose of formal music education by appraising the core values that are shared by particular cultures and that in turn inform musical systems and traditions. Mans's book compellingly serves this challenge, and furthers an ongoing debate about the interface between music, community and school. The book may come across to some as a 'dense' read (I found myself needing to read some sections more than once), but this is understandable given the range of interdisciplinary theory and research from which the author develops her thesis. The various contributions from musicians and scholars undoubtedly add to the richness of the volume – but I found this very richness to be distracting at times, especially where no meaningful connection to the primary text was made explicit. Overall, the book is

clearly laid out, has separate author and subject indices and a comprehensive bibliography. It is likely to appeal to scholars in the areas of music education, ethnomusicology and community music.

References

- BECKER, H. (1982) *Art Worlds*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- BENNETT, A. (2000) *Popular Music and Youth Culture: Music, Identity and Place*. Basingstoke: Macmillan.
- GREEN, L. (2008) *Music, Informal Learning and the School: A New Classroom Pedagogy*. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- HOOD, M. (1960) The Challenge of "Bi-Musicality". *Ethnomusicology*, 4 (2), 55–59.
- MIDDLETON, R. (1990) *Studying Popular Music*. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- SLOBIN, M. (1993) *Subcultural Sounds: Micromusics of the West*. Hanover: University Press of New England for Wesleyan University Press.

JOHN O'FLYNN
ST PATRICK'S COLLEGE,
DUBLIN CITY UNIVERSITY